**MHPE 494: Leadership and Professional Identity**

January 14 – May 3, 2019

Laura E. Hirshfield, PhD

**Course Overview:**

This course will provide an introduction to social science theories that focus on professional identity formation in leadership contexts. We will explore how leaders in the health professions learn the social norms associated with leadership, discuss how these norms are affected by various identities (such as gender, race, nationality, disability, and clinical specialty), and investigate the impact of these types of identities.

**Course Objectives:**

By the end of the course, all students should be able to:

1. Understand and apply social science theory and empirical results related to socialization, identity, impression management, and evaluation.
2. Apply social science theories to leadership in medicine and evaluation of leaders.
3. Conduct a semi-structured, qualitative interview
4. Integrate and apply learning toward a final paper/report

**Course Process:**

All discussion will take place online using Blackboard ([uic.blackboard.com](https://uic.blackboard.com/)), so you can log in and participate at times that are convenient for you. In this kind of class, discussion is essential for learning; it is much easier to understand concepts related to identity and leadership by talking to others with different experiences and identities than your own. Thus, you should expect to read others’ posts and post your own thoughts and responses several times per each discussion block (2 weeks). The Discussion Board section of Blackboard is organized into forums. The first focuses on course process (e.g. general questions), and the rest are devoted to course topics, broken up by weeks.

Here’s how it works:

1. **Discussions:** There is a discussion forum designated for each topic/2-week block. In each forum, you will find separate threads for each reading. If you have additional discussions/topics to raise with the group, feel free to create an additional thread.
2. **Readings:** Plan to read the assigned readings early in the first week of each block, if possible (or if you like, the week prior to when they will be discussed.) As I have noted, there will be a forum for discussing each of the readings separately, but you should feel free to talk about them together in either discussion – the ultimate goal here is comprehension, application, and synthesis. This is the place to post reactions, questions, and anecdotes relating to these concepts. ***The bulk of this class is devoted to discussion of readings and the concepts they raise.***
3. **Interview:** All students will conduct a semi-structured, qualitative interview with a leader of your choice within the field of academic medicine **by 4/15**. We will spend Week 6 briefly discussing and practicing how to conduct a semi-structured interview so that you will be ready to conduct your own for the paper. You will be asked to reflect on your experiences in Week 14, so please plan to take some notes directly after your interview so that you can write a **brief memo** to share with the class. Please see the end of the syllabus for a more detailed description of the assignment.
4. **Final project/paper (due 5/8):** You have two options for your final project/paper, which you may choose depending upon which you feel will be most useful for your future career/learning trajectory:
   1. **Report to a Dean/Dept Chair:** You will be asked to write a brief to provide a (hypothetical) academic leader with insight about the impact of diverse identities and their evaluation. Please see a more detailed description of the paper at the end of this syllabus.
   2. **Leadership Case-Study Paper**: This case-study will rely on the qualitative interview you conducted earlier in the semester. Please see a more detailed description of the paper at the end of this syllabus.
5. ***Optional/supplemental readings*:** I have included optional readings for some weeks of the course (many focus on gender – a topic I know that several of you are particularly interested in) and a large list of additional readings more broadly related to the topics we are covering this semester. You are NOT required to read any of these - I just wanted to give you the opportunity to read more deeply on these topics if you wished. I have included many of the PDFs for these readings in a folder under “Course Documents”, but if there are any listed that you cannot find or access, please let me know.

Finally, if you have questions about the course, please contact me through Blackboard so that your colleagues (who might have similar questions) will see my responses. Please feel free to email me directly, though, if you have any specific questions pertaining to your own papers, etc.

**Readings:**

There is no textbook or coursepack to buy for this course. Instead, you will be asked to download the assigned articles through the library website. For the older articles and book chapters, look for PDFs under the “Course Documents” section of Blackboard. (Those that are posted online are marked with a **BB.**) If you have any issues accessing any readings, please let me know (by email) ASAP.

Things to ask yourself while reading:

1) What is the author’s main point or argument?

2) What theories and/or research methods (i.e., conceptual frameworks) does the author use to demonstrate the main point?

3) What are the strengths and weaknesses of this argument?

4) How do these concepts relate to my own experiences and/or the experiences of leaders in medicine?

**Student Assessment:**

Participation in online discussions: 40 %

Interview & memo: 20%  
Final paper/project (see assignments below): 40 %

**Schedule:**

**Week 1 (1/14): Introductions**

**Weeks 2 & 3 (1/21 & 1/28): Professional Socialization**

* Vaidyanathan, Brandon. 2015. “Professional Socialization in Medicine - American Medical Association Journal of Ethics (Formerly Virtual Mentor).” *Virtual Mentor* 17(2):164.
* Cruess, R. L., S. R. Cruess, J. D. Boudreau, L. Snell, and Y. Steinert. 2015. “A Schematic Representation of the Professional Identity Formation and Socialization of Medical Students and Residents: A Guide for Medical Educators.” *Acad Med* 90(6):718–25.
* **Optional:** Martin, S. C., R. M. Arnold, and R. M. Parker. 1988. “Gender and Medical Socialization.” *Journal of health and social behavior* 29(4):333–43.

**Weeks 4 & 5 (2/4 & 2/11): Identity**

* Ridgeway, Cecilia L. 2003. Status characteristics and leadership." *Leadership and power: Identity processes in groups and organizations*: 65-78. **(BB)**
* **Optional:** Hogg, Michael A. 2001. “A Social Identity Theory of Leadership.” *Personality and Social Psychology Review* 5(3):184–200.

**Week 6 (2/18): Interviewing**

* Weiss, Robert S. 1994. “Interviewing.” in *Learning From Strangers*. New York, NY: The Free Press. **(BB)**
* **Recommended (but optional):** Jody Miller and Barry Glasner. 1997. “The ‘inside’ and ‘outside’: Finding realities in interviews ” in *Qualitative Research: Theory, Method, and Practice,* ed. David Silverman. **(BB)**

**Weeks 7 & 8 (2/25 & 3/4): Impression Management & Attire**

* Goffman, E. (1959). *The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life*. New York: Double Day. Introduction. **(BB)**
* **Optional:** Leary, Mark R. 1989. “Self-Presentational Processes in Leadership Emergence and Effectiveness.” Pp. 363–74 in *Impression Management in the Organization*. **(BB)**
* Pratt, Michael G., and Anat Rafaeli. (1997). “Organizational Dress as a Symbol of Multilayered Social Identities.” *The Academy of Management Journal* 40(4):862-898. **\*\*\*Focus on pages 862-868.**

**Week 9 & 10 (3/11 & 3/18): Emotions & Language**

* Hochschild, Arlie. 2014. “Emotion Work and Feeling Rules.” Pp. 56–62 in *Inside Social Life: Readings in Sociological Psychology and Microsociology*, edited by Spencer E Cahill, Kent Sandstrom, and Carissa Froyum. New York: Oxford University Press. **(BB)**
* **Optional:** Lively, Kathryn J. 2006. “Emotions in the Workplace.” in *Handbook of the Sociology of Emotions*, edited by Jan E. Stets and Jonathan H. Turner. Springer. \*\*\***Read pages 569-574** (stop at Gender Section) **(BB)**
* Karen Tracy. 2002. *Everyday Talk.* Chapter 1. **(BB)**
* **Optional:** Carli, Linda L. 2013. “Gendered Communication and Social Influence.” Pp. 199–2016 in *The SAGE Handbook of Gender and Psychology*. SAGE. **(BB)**

**Week 11 (3/25): SPRING BREAK**

**Weeks 12 & 13 (4/1 & 4/8): Leadership, Evaluation, and Identity**

* Carli, Linda L. and Alice H. Eagly. 2001. “Gender, Hierarchy, and Leadership: An Introduction.” *Journal of Social Issues* 57(4):629–36.
* Carnes, Molly, Claudia Morrissey, and Stacie E. Geller. 2008. “Women’s Health and Women’s Leadership in Academic Medicine: Hitting the Same Glass Ceiling?” *Journal of women’s health (2002)* 17(9):1453–62.
* Knight, Jennifer L., Michelle R. Hebl, Jessica B. Foster, and Laura M. Mannix. (2003). “Out of Role? Out of Luck: The Influence of Race and Leadership Status on Performance Appraisals.” *Journal of Leadership & Organizational Studies* 9(3):85–93.
* **Optional:** Lively, Kathryn J. 2006. “Emotions in the Workplace.” in *Handbook of the Sociology of Emotions*, edited by Jan E. Stets and Jonathan H. Turner. Springer. \*\*\***Read pages 569-577 –Gender & Race Sections** (stop at “Social Consequences of Emotional Labor”) **(BB)**

**Weeks 14 (4/15) – Discuss Interview Memos**

**Week 15 & 16 (4/22 & 4/29): Work on Final Paper (Due 5/8)**

**Supplemental Readings:**

Professional Socialization:

* Freidson, Eliot. *Profession of medicine: a study of the sociology of applied knowledge*. University of Chicago Press, 1988.
* Fox, Renée C. (1957). "Chapter 2: Training for Uncertainty". In Merton, Robert K.; Reader, George; Kendall, Patricia L. *The Student-Physician: Introductory Studies in the Sociology of Medical Education*. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press. pp. 207–241.
* Becker, Howard Saul, ed. *Boys in white: Student culture in medical school*. Transaction publishers, 2002.
* Kaiser, R. (2002) Fixing identity by denying uniqueness: An analysis of professional identity in medicine. *Journal of Medical Humanities, 23*(2), 95-105.
* Veazey Brooks, J., & Bosk, C. L. (2012). Remaking surgical socialization: work hour restrictions, rites of passage, and occupational identity. *Social Science & Medicine*, 75(9), 1625–32.
* Pitkala, K. H. and T. Mantyranta. 2003. “Professional Socialization Revised: Medical Students’ Own Conceptions Related to Adoption of the Future Physician's Role--a Qualitative Study.” *Medical Teacher* 25(2):155–60.

Identity:

* De Rue, D. S., & Ashford, S. J. (2010). Who Will Lead and Who Will Follow? A Social Process of Leadership Identity Construction in Organizations. *Academy of Management Review*, *35*(4), 627–647.
* Ashforth, Blake E. and Fred Mael. (1989). “Social Identity Theory and the Organizaton.” *Academy of Management* 14(1):20–39.
* Cerulo, Karen A. 1997. “Identity Construction: New Issues, New Directions.” *Annual Review of Sociology* 23(1):385–409.
* Howard, Judith A. 2000. “Social Psychology of Identities.” *Annual Review of Sociology* 26:367–93.

Impression Management:

* Goffman, Erving. 2014 (1967). “Face Work and Interaction Rituals.” Pp. 265–74 in Inside Social Life: Readings in Sociological Psychology and Microsociology, edited by Spencer E Cahill, Kent Sandstrom, and Carissa Froyum. New York: Oxford University Press. **(BB)**
* Cahill, Spencer E. 1989. “Fashioning Males and Females: Appearance Management and the Social Reproduction of Gender.” *Symbolic Interaction* 12(2):281–98.

Attire:

* Peluchette, Joy V., Katherine Karl, and Kathleen Rust. 2006. “Dressing to Impress: Beliefs and Attitudes Regarding Workplace Attire.” *Journal of Business and Psychology* 21(1):45–63.

Language:

* Anspach, R. R. (1988). Notes on the sociology of medical discourse: the language of case presentation. *Journal of Health and Social Behavior,* 29(4), 357–75.
* Hsieh, Elaine. 2007. “Interpreters as Co-Diagnosticians: Overlapping Roles and Services between Providers and Interpreters.” *Social Science and Medicine* 64(4):924–37.

Emotion:

* Hochschild, A. (1983). “Managing Feeling” and “Feeling Rules”, in *The Managed Heart: Commercialization of Human Feeling*. **(BB)**
* Humphrey, R. H. (2002). The Many Faces of Emotional Leadership. *The Leadership Quarterly*, *13*(5), 493–504.
* Hafferty, Frederic W. 1988. “Cadaver Stories and the Emotional Socialization of Medical Students.” *Journal of Health and Social Behavior* 29(4):344–56.
* Hsieh, Elaine and Brenda Nicodemus. 2015. “Conceptualizing Emotion in Healthcare Interpreting: A Normative Approach to Interpreters’ Emotion Work.” *Patient Education and Counseling* 98(12):1474–81.
* Underman, Kelly and Laura E. Hirshfield. 2016. “Detached Concern?: Emotional Socialization in Twenty-First Century Medical Education.” *Social Science & Medicine* 160:94–101.
* Rogalin, Christabel L. and Laura E. Hirshfield. 2013. “Emotion and Leadership: What Scholarship on Status and Identity Can Tell Us.” *Sociology Compass* 7(6):487–501.
* Hirshfield, Laura E. and Kelly Underman. 2017. “Empathy in Medical Education: A Case for Social Construction.” *Patient Education and Counseling* 100(4):785–87.

Gender:

* Hoyt, Crystal L. 2010. “Women, Men, and Leadership: Exploring the Gender Gap at the Top.” *Social and Personality Psychology Compass* 4(7):484–98.
* Crystal L. Hoyt. “Women in Leadership.” in *Leadership* by Peter G. Northouse. **(BB)**
* Eagly, A. H. (2003). The female leadership advantage: An evaluation of the evidence. *The Leadership Quarterly*, *14*(6), 807–834.
* Bird, S. R. (2011). Unsettling Universities’ Incongruous, Gendered Bureaucratic Structures: A Case-study Approach. *Gender, Work & Organization*, *18*(2), 202–230.

Race:

* Livingston, R. W., Rosette, A. S., & Washington, E. F. (2012). Can an Agentic Black Woman Get Ahead? The Impact of Race and Interpersonal Dominance on Perceptions of Female Leaders. *Psychological Science*, *23*(4), 354–358.
* Ospina, S., & Foldy, E. (2009). A critical review of race and ethnicity in the leadership literature: Surfacing context, power and the collective dimensions of leadership. *The Leadership Quarterly*, *20*(6), 876–896.

Evaluation:

* Laube, H., Massoni, K., Sprague, J., & Ferber, A. L. (2007). The Impact of Gender on the Evaluation of Teaching: What We Know and What We Can Do. *NWSA Journal*, *19*(3), 87–104.
* Eagly, Alice H., Mona G. Makhijani, and Bruce G. Klonsky. 1992. “Gender and the Evaluation of Leaders: A Meta-Analysis.” *Psychological Bulletin* 111(1):3–22.
* Isaac, Carol, Jocelyn Chertoff, Barbara Lee, and Molly Carnes. 2011. “Do Studentsʼ and Authorsʼ Genders Affect Evaluations? A Linguistic Analysis of Medical Student Performance Evaluations.” *Academic Medicine* 86(1):59–66.
* McOwen, Katherine S., Lisa M. Bellini, Carmen E. Guerra, and Judy a Shea. 2007. “Evaluation of Clinical Faculty: Gender and Minority Implications.” *Academic medicine : journal of the Association of American Medical Colleges* 82(10 Suppl):S94-6.

**Assignments**

**Interview Assignment:**

* Identify a person who is in a leadership position in the health professions (this can be broadly understood). Conduct an interview with this person (face-to-face, using skype/zoom, or over the phone) using questions you have formulated in advance. If possible, record this interview (you can use the recording feature or zoom/skype, your phone, or a digital recorder). If not possible, take notes during the interview and immediately afterwards.
* Areas to cover in the interview include (but are not limited to):
  + Basic biographical information and information about their organizational affiliation.
  + Brief history of how they became a leader and their experiences in leadership. What successes or changes have they seen?
  + What pressing problems are they still facing?
  + Specific questions related to their identity and professional socialization.
  + Choices they’ve made regarding impression management, attire, or emotion management.
  + Experiences of bias (especially related to their identity)
* Whether or not you choose to use this interview for your final paper, write up a brief memo about the experience of conducting the interview. What was it like? What challenges did you face logistically? Did you like interviewing? These memos will be the fodder for our discussion in Week 12, so be sure to have your interview completed by 4/15.

**Final Paper:**

**Option 1: Identity Brief**

Your task is to put together a brief to submit the dean of a medical school (or to a similar person in a leadership position). Think of this as an opportunity to educate them about diverse identities and the consequence of identity for their evaluation (and subsequent hiring, promotion, etc.)

1. Begin by describing the issues and/or effects of membership in non-dominant groups in medicine.
2. Next, detail issues of evaluation and what the dean needs to know about gender, race, nationality, etc. in evaluating their subordinates. What should they be thinking about? What policies should be put in place?

Briefs will be judged most favorably for showing insightful critical thinking and **thoughtful application** of content from the course. These do not need to be long – indeed, briefs are most successful when they succinctly explain the issue and make clear, reasoned arguments concisely. However, because this is not a long paper, you will have less opportunity to demonstrate your expertise and knowledge about the course material. A final copy of the brief should be sent to lhirshf@uic.edu **by Wednesday, May 8, 2019**.

**Option 2: Interview Paper**

* Write a paper connecting insights gained from your interview with our class discussions.
  1. Begin by describing your interviewee.
  2. What did you learn about professional identity, gender, race, differential evaluation, interprofessional collaboration, etc. from this interview?
  3. How (if at all) have they dealt with issues related to impression management, emotion, or attire in their day-to-day lives? Have these issues impacted them?

Papers will be judged most favorably for showing insightful critical thinking and **thoughtful application** of content from the course. Papers should not be more than 10 double-spaced pages, excluding references and appendices (including your interview questions). Papers should be written in a scholarly tone. A final copy of the paper should be sent to lhirshf@uic.edu **by Wednesday, May 8, 2019**.